Case: 21-16351, 06/09/2022, ID: 12467468, DktEntry: 40, Page 1 of 2

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP

RONALD L. OLSON
ROBERT E.DENHAM
JEFFREY I. WEINBERGER
CARY B. LERMAN
GREGORY P. STONE
BRAD D. BRIAN
GEORGE M. GARVEY
WILLIAM D. TEMKO
JOHN W. SPIEGEL
DONALD B. VERRILLI, JR. P.C.*
TERRY E. SANCHEZ
STEVEN M. PERRY
JOSEPH D. LEE
MICHAEL R. DOYEN
MICHAEL E. SOLOFF
KATHLEEN M. M*DOWELL
GLENN D. POMERANTZ
HOMAS B. WALPER GLENN D. POMERANT
THOMAS B. WALPER
HENRY WEISSMANN
KEVIN S. ALLRED
JEFFREY A. HEINTZ
JUDITH T. KITANO
GARTH T. VINCENT
TED DANE
STUART N. SENATOR
MARTIN D. BERN
POREPT I DELLANG ROBERT L. DELL ANGELO JONATHAN E. ALTMAN JONATHAN E. ALTMAN
KELLY M. KLAUS
DAVID B. GOLDMAN
DAVID H. FRY
LISA J. DEMSKY
LISA J. DEMSKY
LISA J. DEMSKY
RALCOLM A. HEINICKE
MALCOLM A. HEINICKE
ROHIT K. SINGLA
CAROLYN HOECKER LUEDTKE
C. DAVID LEE
BREIT J. RODDA P.C.*
KATHERINE M. FORSTER
BLANCA FROMM YOUNG
SETH GOLDMAN BLANCA FROMM YOUNG SETH GOLDMAN GRANT A. DAVIS-DENNY JONATHAN H. BLAVIN JONATHAN H. BLAVIN
DANIEL B. LEVIN
MIRIAM KIM
MISTY M. SANFORD
HAILYN J. CHEN
BETHANY W. KRISTOVICH
JACOB S. KREILKAMP
JEFFREYY, WU
LAURA D. SMOLOWE

KYLE W. MACH
HEATHER E. TAKAHASHI
ERIN J. COX
BENJAMIN J. HORWICH
E. MARTIN ESTRADA
BRYAN H. HECKENLIVELY
ELAINE J. GOLDENBERG P.C.*
GINGER D. ANDERS P.C.*
MARGARET G. MARASCHINO
JOHN M. GILDERSLEEVE
ADAM B. WEISS
KELLY L.C. KRIEBS
JEREMY A. LAWRENCE
LAURA K. LIN
ACHYUT J. PHADKE
ZACHARY M. BRIERS
JENNIFER M. BRODER
KURUVILLA J. OLASA
JUSTIN P. RAPHAEL
ROSE LEDA EHLER
JOHN W. BERRY
ROBYM K. BACON
JORDAN D. SEGALL
JONATHAN KRAVIS*
KAREN A. LORANG
JOHN L. SCHWAB JONATHAN KRAVIS*
KAREN A, LORANG
JOHN L. SCHWAB
EMILY C. CURRAN-HUBERTY
MATTHEW S. SCHONHOLZ
AIMEE M. CONTRERAS-CAMUA
L. ASHLEY AULL
WESLEY TL. BURRELL
CRAIG JENNINGS LAVOIE
JENNINGS LAVOIE WESTETTIL BURNELLO
GRAIG JENNINGS LAVOI
JENNIFER L. BRYANT
NICHOLAS D. FRAM
TYLER HILTON
TYLER HILTON
TYLER HILTON
JESSICA REICH BARIL
JUNNELL JESSICA REICH BARIL
JUNN M. KEECHER
MATTHEW K. DONOHUE
JOHN B. MAJOR
LAUREN C. BARNETT
NICK R. SIDNEY
SKYLAR B. GROVE
SARAH S. LEE
LAURA M. LOPEZ
COLIN A. DEVINE
DANE P. SHIKMAN
LEXI PEZCOCK

LEXI PEACOCK MAGGIE THOMPSON

560 MISSION STREET GIOVANNI S. TWENTY-SEVENTH FLOOR SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105-3089 TELEPHONE (415) 512-4000 FACSIMILE (415) 512-4077

350 SOUTH GRAND AVENUE FIFTIETH FLOOR LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90071-3426 TELEPHONE (213) 683-9100 FACSIMILE (213) 687-3702

> SUITE 500E WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-5369 TELEPHONE (202) 220-1100 FACSIMILE (202) 220-2300

> 601 MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE NW

June 9, 2022

SAMUEL H. ALLEN ALLISON M. DAY SAARMAN GONZÁLEZ ALLISON M, DAY
GIOVANNI S, SAARMAN GONZÁLEZ
STEPHANIE G, HERRERA
TERESA REED DIPPO
DANIEL BENYAMIN
SARA A, MCDERMOTT
J, MAX ROSEN
RACHEL G, MILLER-ZIEGLER*
ANNE K, CONLEY
DAVID W, MORESHEAD
ANDRE W, BREWSTER III
ROWLEY J, RICE
DAHLIA MIGNOUNA*
BRANDON R, TEACHOUT
USHA CHILUKURI VANCE
ALEXANDER S, GORIN
ZARA BARI
BRENDAN B, GANTS*
LAUREN E, ROSS*
BENJAMIN G, BAROKH
MICHELE C, NIELSEN
APRIL YOUPEE-ROLL
COBUS VAN DER VEN
MICHELE C, NIELSEN
APRIL YOUPEE-ROLL
COBUS VAN DER VEN
MEGAN MCCREADIE
STEPHEN HYLAS
ARIEL TESHUVA
SHANNON GALVIN AMINIRAD STEPHEN HYLAS
ARIEL TESHUVA
SHANNON GALVIN AMINIRAD
XIAONAN APRIL HU*
NATALIE KARL
BRANDON MARTINEZ
ERINMA E. MAN BRANDON MARTINEZ.
ERINMA E. MAN
ANDREW LEWIS
CARRIE C. LITTEN
RUBY J. GARRETTJAMES R. SALZMANN
SAMIR HALAWI
ROBIN S. GRAY
MICA L. MOORS
MICA L. MOORS
MICH SELVIN
HUNTER V. ARMOUR
ATHANIEL F. SUSSMAN
PALL E. MARTIN
REBECCA L. SCIARRINO PAUL E. MARTIN
REBECCA L. SCIARRINO
CORY M. BATZA
BRIAN R. BOESSENECKER
AVI REJWAN OVED
ROBERT E. BOWEN
RICHARD T. JOHNSON

GRACE DAVIS FISHER
LAUREN N. BECK
CALEB W. PEIFFER
ANDRES CANTERO, JR.
GREGORY T. S. BISCHOPING
STEVEN B. R. LEVICK
SARA H. WORTH
NATALLE G. MOYCE
ULLIAM M. ORR
GABRIEL M. BRONSHTEYN
JING JIN
ALEX C. WERNER
ROSIO FLORES GREGORY ROSIO FLORES
JESSICA O LAIDE
ERICA C. TOOCH
EVELYN DANFORTH-SCOH
EVELYN DANFORTH-SCOH
ANDREW T. NGUYEN
RACHEL M. SCHIFF
MRANDA E. REHAUT
TIANA S. BAHERI
STEPHANY REAVES
STEPHANY REAVES

OF COUNSEL

ROBERT K. JOHNSON
PATRICK J. CAFFERTY, JR.
PETER A. DETRE
PETER E. GRATZINGER
JENRY H. HONG
KIMBERLY A. CHI
ADAM R. LAWTON
MICHAEL E. GREANEY
SARAH J. COLE
SARAH J. COLE
FAYE PAUL TELLER

E. LEROY TOLLES

Writer's Direct Contact (415) 512-4017 (415) 644-6917 FAX kelly.klaus@mto.com

Molly C. Dwyer, Clerk of the Court Office of the Clerk U.S. Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit P.O. Box 193939 San Francisco, CA 94119-3939

> Javier v. Assurance IO, LLC, No. 21-16351 Re:

Dear Ms. Dwyer:

Pursuant to Ninth Circuit Rule 36-4, Appellees submit this response to Appellant's letter requesting publication of the Court's May 31, 2022 Memorandum disposition. Appellees respectfully submit that, contrary to Appellant's contentions, the Memorandum disposition does not merit publication.

It appears that the Court may have decided not to publish its disposition because the Memorandum considered an issue of California law that the state courts have not yet decided. The Memorandum addressed whether Cal. Penal Code § 631(a) required prior consent. As the Court explained, the California Supreme Court has not addressed that question, which required the Court to "predict" how the California Supreme Court would interpret the statute. Mem. 4. To do so, the Court looked to what it expressly noted was dicta from two decisions of the California Supreme Court, neither of which addressed whether consent must be given in advance and one of which did not even interpret § 631. See id. at 4-5. By issuing an unpublished decision, the Court avoided creating binding precedent on an undecided state law issue without the benefit of directly on-point precedent from any California court.

Case: 21-16351, 06/09/2022, ID: 12467468, DktEntry: 40, Page 2 of 2

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP

Molly C. Dwyer, Clerk of the Court June 9, 2022 Page 2

In addition, Appellees submit that the unpublished nature of the disposition is appropriate given the lack of adversarial briefing regarding the cases on which the Court relied. One of the cases on which the Court focused—*Kearney v. Salomon Smith Barney, Inc.*, 137 P.3d 914 (Cal. 2006)—was raised for the first time in Appellant's reply brief. The portion of *Ribas v. Clark*, 696 P.2d 637 (Cal. 1985), on which the Court relied was not discussed in the parties' briefs. *See* Mem. 4 ("[T]he Privacy Act has been read to require the assent of all parties to a communication *before another may listen*." (quoting *Ribas v. Clark*, 696 P.2d 637, 640-41 (Cal. 1985))). Because the decision is not published, it does not bind future panels which may have the benefit of full briefing regarding these cases.

Appellant's arguments that the decision should be published are unavailing. Appellant asserts that the Court should publish the Memorandum because it "clarifies a previously unsettled question of statutory interpretation" and "will likely be instructive" in future cases that "frequently" raise the issue. Appellant's Letter 1. The former argument fails to acknowledge that, as explained above, the Court's decision addressed an unsettled *state law* question and that issuing a published decision might tie the hands of future panels that have additional guidance from state courts. The latter argument ignores that unpublished dispositions may still be cited as persuasive authority, so there is no need to publish the Memorandum for it to "be instructive" in future cases, *id. See* Ninth Circuit Rule 36-3(b); *e.g.*, *Pleitez-Lopez v. Barr*, 935 F.3d 716, 720 n.2 (9th Cir. 2019).

For these reasons, Appellees respectfully submit that the Court should deny Appellant's request to publish the disposition.

Very truly yours,

Kelly M. Klaus